Asian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Research



# Solid State Fermentation of Plant Protein Meals Using Lactobacillus acidophilus for Improving Feed Value

U. D. Enyidi<sup>1,2\*</sup> and S. Ekeh<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Biotechnology and Applied Biology, Godfrey Okoye University, Thinkers Corner, Emene Enugu, Enugu State Nigeria. <sup>2</sup>Department of Fisheries and Aquatic Resources Management, Michael Okpara University of Agriculture Umudike, Umuahia Abia State Nigeria.

### Authors' contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration between both authors. Author UDE designed the study, performed the statistical analysis, wrote the protocol and wrote the first draft of the manuscript. Author SE carried out the day to day running of the work under author UDE supervision. Authors SE and UDE read the work. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

#### Article Information

DOI: 10.9734/AJFAR/2018/v2i430018 <u>Editor(s):</u> (1) Dr. Jorge Castro Mejia, Department of El Hombre Y Su Ambiente, Universidad Autonoma Metropolitana Xochimilco. <u>Mexico.</u> (1) Rasaq Ibrahim, University of Science and Technology, Kebbi State, Nigeria. (2) Shaiful Azuar Mohamad, Malaysia. Complete Peer review History: <u>http://www.sdiarticle3.com/review-history/47647</u>

**Original Research Article** 

Received 21 November 2018 Accepted 27 February 2019 Published 13 March 2019

# ABSTRACT

Usage of some legumes and oil seed meal as fishmeal substitute is hampered by low protein content and anti nutritional factors (ANF). Inclusion of some exogenous enzyme cocktail like phytase, xylanase can reduce some ANF but is costly. Solid state fermentation of plant proteins is affordable and could be useful in upgrading the protein content, elevating the nutrient and mineral status and eliminating ANF from plant-based feed ingredients. We therefore extracted *Lactobacillus acidophilus* from intestine of adult African catfish. Extracted *L. acidophilus* was cultured at 37°C for 48 hrs in Mueller-Hinton Broth. Approximately 10 g of the bacteria broth containing 9.4 log 10 colony forming unit (CFU) per ml was mixed with 200 g meals of bambaranut meal and African yam beans meal placed in a brown bottom flask. The ground meals and bacteria mixtures were fermented for 72 hours. Temperature was maintained at 28.6°C to 34°C. The pH of

\*Corresponding author: Email: enyidiuche@yahoo.com;



the mixtures was measured everyday and the fermenting mixture was regularly stirred. Fermentation was stopped after 72 hrs and the meals were subjected to proximate analysis. Protein content of the meals significantly increased (P<0.05) as follows: BNM, 24.82 $\pm$ 0.15% to 40.37 $\pm$ 0.27% and AYB, 23.65 $\pm$ 0.07% to 34.56 $\pm$ 1.36%. Lipid content of meals significantly increased (P<0.05) as follows BNM, 7.11 $\pm$ 0.01 to 14.29 $\pm$ 0.05% and AYB, 2.96 $\pm$ 0.45% to 5.76 $\pm$ 0.09%. There was general decrease in composition of carbohydrate and ANFs were drastically reduced or completely eliminated from the meals.

Keywords: Solid state fermentation; Lactobacillus; anti nutritional factor; sesame seed; African yam beans; bambaranut meal.

# 1. INTRODUCTION

Solid state fermentation is a bioprocess where microbial organism undertakes fermentation of substrate matrix in absence of free-flowing water [1,2,3]. Although abundant water is absent in solid state fermentation the substrate must have enough water to sustain growth of microbes [4]. Based on the nature of substrate used solid state fermentation can be classified into two, those cultivated on natural material and inert materials [5]. Solid state fermentation is becoming more important because of bioactive compound or secondary metabolites produced in the process [6,7,8]. Solid sate fermentation has been used in reduction of non-starch polysaccharides and  $\alpha$ galactosides of soybean meal [9]. It has also been used in degrading glucosinolate in rapeseed meal [10]. Solid state fermentation could produce enzyme like phytase [4], xylanase [11], glucanases and xylanase [12], from the bioprocess of the microbe on the substrate matrix. These enzymes have immense application in feed industry. African vam beans (AYB) Sphenostylis stenocarpa is a neglected legume belonging to the family Papilionacea, subfamily Leguminosae [13]. African yam beans are cultivated in Western, Central and Eastern Africa. AYB is proteinous and the protein content is about 21-24% [14,15]. Africa yam beans have been included in feed of African catfish with results. Bambaranut (Voandzeia mixed subterranea) is a proteinoid legume belonging to the family Fabaceae. Bambaranut has always been regarded as of African origin therefore a C4 plant [16,17]. But analysis of naturally occurring stable isotopes of  $\overline{\delta}^{13}$ C and  $\overline{\delta}^{15}$ N showed that Bambaranut is a C3 plant like soybean [18]. Consequently, it could be that bambaranut was introduced by early explorers or is an outlier in the C4, C3 plant continuum. The crude protein content of bambaranut is 24-28 % [16,17,19]. The crude lipid content of Bambaranut is about 12-18 % [20,17,21]. Bambaranut is a good substitute of soybean in the diets of African

catfish. Bambaranut also has lesser content of ANF like phytate than soybean [22]. Substitution of fishmeal with solid state fermented bambaranut meal (BNM) in the diets of African catfish *C. gariepinus* produced faster growth rate of the fish than the unfermented BNM [23]. Lactic acid bacteria LAB and carnobacterium species occurs as normal flora within the intestine of most healthy fish [24,25]. The application of LAB in fermentation of feed products enhances the palatability and microbiological safety [26].

This research is aimed at analyzing the nutritional effects of separately fermenting bambaranut meal (BNM) and African yam beans (AYB) meal with *Lactobacillus acidophilus* using solid state techniques.

#### 2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

#### 2.1 African Yam Beans

Grains of African yam beans (AYB) were purchased from open grain market at Enugu Nigeria. The grains were sorted to remove unwanted particles and stones. Sorted AYB were then autoclaved at 100°C for 15 mins, cooled and then cracked in a mill. The seed coats were removed after the cracking and the seed were ground to dust using a hammer mill. The ground meals were stored in air tight container till used within 24 hrs.

#### 2.2 Bambaranut Meal

Bambaranut meal was produced from bambara groundnut purchased from open grains market in Enugu Nigeria. The grains were carefully sorted, and bad grains and stones were removed. The grains were washed with clean water and dried at 55°C for 1 h. The bambaranut were then autoclaved at 100°C for 5 mins. After autoclaving the seed were cooled and cracked in a hammer mill and the grains were milled to dust, so as to pass a 40-mesh sieve and stored in air tight container for use within 24 hrs.

# Process flow chart for production of solid state fermented African yam beans meal (AYBM) for improved feed production

African yam beans seed purchased  $\downarrow$ Sorting and removal of unwanted material and bad seed  $\downarrow$ Washing of seed with clean water  $\downarrow$ Drying of seed at 55°C  $\downarrow$ Milling of seed to dust in hammer mill  $\downarrow$ Sieving of meal and removal of particles of hard seed coat  $\downarrow$ Cooling of AYBM at room temperature  $\downarrow$ Mixing with *L. acidophilus* broth  $\downarrow$ Fermented for 72 hours  $\downarrow$ Drying of seed at 55°C  $\downarrow$ Milling of meal in attrition mill  $\downarrow$ Solid state fermented AYBM  $\downarrow$ Storage in cool dry place

### 2.3 Micro Organism Used and Solid-State Fermentation

The Lactobacillus acidophilius used in this experiment were extracted from the gut of matured African catfish Clarias gariepinus. Mature African catfish of weight 865 g and length 68 cm were stocked at 2 fish per 35 litre glass aquaria. The catfish was sacrificed with a gentle blow on the head. The stunned fish was dissected, and the gut was divided into foregut, mid gut and hind gut. The gut was cut open horizontally and 5 g of the intestine piece was cut and minced in a test tube with distilled water making it up to 1 ml. The 1 ml stock solution was mixed with 9mls of distilled water to give a 1:10 dilution. The mixture was vortex for 5 mins. This same procedure was carried out for intestinal samples from mid gut and hind gut. The stock solution was diluted with sterile 0.1% peptone water up to 10<sup>-6</sup> according to [27]. 1 m of the stock dilution was spread using pour plate techniques, on two replicate plates of nutrient agar, tryptic soy agar plates (TSA; MERCK, GERMANY). MacConkey agar and Eosin methylene blue agar, were added to determine

the total bacterial counts, using sterile glass spreader. The agar plates were incubated at 36°C for 48 hrs. Plates were read after incubation by considering and selecting those plates containing between 30-300. The counting was done using and illuminated colony counter. The isolation of identified colonies was done by sub culturing of representative samples on freshly prepared plates. The plates were incubated at 37°C for 48 hours. The colonies were subculture in tryptic soy agar plates (TSA; Merck, Germany) to obtain pure cultures. Bacterial isolates were subjected to morphological and biochemical characterisation of the sub cultured based on Gram staining techniques according to the Bergey's manual of determinative bacteriology [28,27]. Morphological characteristics examined colour, edge, elevation, shape and arrangement of microorganisms. Microorganisms were examined under slide was made in oil immersion after Gram staining. The biochemical tests carried out in characterisation of the microbes were catalase test, coagulase test, motility test, oxidase test after [29]; sugar fermentation test and Voges -Proskauer test [30]. Extracted L. acidophilus was cultured at

 $37^{\circ}$ C for 48 hrs in Mueller Hinton broth. The fermentation was done in triplicates. The grinded plant protein meals (bambaranut meal, sesame seed meal and African yam beans meal) were weighed and 200 g, separated for the experiment. The `grinded meals were placed in a brown bottom flask and 10 g of the bacteria (*L. acidophilus*) broth containing 9.4 log 10 colony forming unit (CFU) per ml was mixed with the meals. The mixtures were fermented for 72 hours. The temperature was regularly checked and recorded. The temperature of the mixture

ranged from 28.6°C to 34°C. The temperature of the fermented meal fluctuated constantly from 28.6°C to 34°C through the period of solid-state fermentation. The mixtures were stirred according to methods stated in Enyidi and Etim [23]. The pH of the mixtures was measured everyday using a pH meter. The fermentation was arrested after 72 hrs and the plant protein meals were subjected to proximate analysis to determine the effects of the solid-state fermentation of the nutritional quality of the meals.

# Process flow chart for production of solid state fermented bambaranut meal for improved feed production

Bambara ground nut seed purchased Sorting and removal of unwanted material and bad seed Washing of seed with clean water Drying of seed at 55°C Milling of seed to dust in hammer mill Sieving of meal and removal of particles of hard seed coat Cooling of bambaranut meal at room temperature Mixing with L. acidophilus broth 1 Fermented for 72 hours Drying of seed at 55°C Milling of meal in attrition mill Solid state fermented BNM Storage in cool dry place

#### 2.4 Proximate Analysis

The crude protein analyses dried samples were done by Kjeldahl method using Tecator kjeltec model 1002 system with block digestion plus steam distillation. The crude protein was calculated as %N x 6.25. The total lipids of the fermented meals were analyzed by chloroform-methanol extraction at a ratio of 2:1 [31,32,21]. Moisture content of the feeds was determined by oven drying feed samples at 105°C. Ash content was determined by incineration samples in a muffle furnace at 550°C for 24 hrs. The ash % was weight of ash/weight of sample x 100. The energy value was measured using a bomb calorimeter and expressed in kcal.

#### 2.5 Anti Nutritional Factors

The phytate was measured after [33]. The phytic acid of the raw and fermented meal variants was analysed.

#### 2.6 Mineral Composition

The metal contents of the meals were measured by weighing 2.0 g of the meals mixing this with the digesting mixture made of 1 ml of 30% hydrogen peroxide (H<sub>2</sub>0<sub>2</sub>) and 6 ml of concentrated nitric acid (HNO3). The mixture was placed in a microwave set at 70°C till digestion was over. The digested samples were filtered using what-man filter paper, the filtrate was diluted with distilled water in a 250ml volumetric flask. Resultant solution was analysed Atomic for metals usina Absorption Spectrophotometer (UNICAM 939) that is connected to MS Window application software.

#### 2.7 Calculations and Statistical Analysis

The mean values of the proximate analysis from the three plant protein meals were subjected to one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA). Pair wise independent t test was carried out to examine significant differences between the proximate analyses of fermented and nonfermented variants of each plant protein meal.

### 3. RESULTS

The results of pair wise independent t test analysis of proximate content of bambarant meal shows that there are significant differences between the proximate composition of fermented and non-fermented bambaranut meal. The proximate compositions of the raw bambaranut meal are tabulated in Table 1. The proximate compositions of bambaranut meal were generally increased after the four days of fermentation. Protein content of the fermented meal (40.37±0.27%) (Means ±SD) was significantly higher than the raw meal (24.82±0.15%) (P<0.05) Table 2. The lipid content of the BNM was significantly increased from 7.11±0.01% of the raw BNM to 14.29±0.05% of the fermented BNM (P<0.05). Conversely, the carbohydrate content of the fermented BNM (20.65±0.27 %) was much lower than the content of the raw BNM 54.59±0.06% (Table 2). Crude fibre of the raw BNM was 7.62±0.15% but this was reduced to 2.41±0.06 in the fermented BNM. Moisture content of the raw BNM was significantly increased after the solid-state fermentation. Moisture content increased from 9.15±0.06% of the raw BNM to 16.26±0.59% of the fermented BNM (P<0.05). Consequently, dry matter of the fermented BNM, 83.74±0.58 was lower than that of the raw BNM 90.8±0.01. There was however no difference in the dry matter of the fermented

and raw BNM (P>0.05). There was however a significant increase in the ash content of the fermented BNM  $9.53\pm0.03\%$  compared to the raw BNM  $4.52\pm0.03\%$  (P<0.05).

Copper, sodium, iron and zinc: Raw bambaranut meal is a good source of calcium. The calcium content of raw bambaranut meal was 244.5 ± 0.06 mg/100 g. Solid state fermentation of BNM significantly (P<0.05) elevated the calcium content to 400.06±0.12 mg/100 g. Phosphorous composition of raw BNM was 74.56±0.78, while fermented BNM had phosphorous content of 140.56±0.56 mg/100 g (Table 3). Similarly, there was significant increase in the potassium content of the fermented meal. The raw BNM had potassium content of 182.09±0.08 mg/100 g while the fermented had 203.67±0.05 mg/100 g. The magnesium (Mg) content of the BNM was not much affected by the solid-state fermentation. The Mg content of the raw BNM was 134.05±0.58 mg/100 g but after fermentation the Mg value was significantly increased to 183.47±0.13mg/100g (P<0.05). The copper content of raw BNM was 3.89±0.78 mg/100 g but this was doubled 6.23  $\pm$  0.89 mg/100 g in the solid state fermented BNM (Table 3). Raw BNM has low content of sodium 19.98±0.56 ma/100 a. Solid state fermentation of BNM significantly (P<0.05), increased the sodium content to 29.09±0.08 mg/100 g. Conversely, the iron content of the raw BNM was very low 1.57±0.07 mg/100 g. The iron content of the fermented BNM 1.54±1.23 mg/100 g was not significantly different from the raw BNM (P>0.05). Zinc content of raw BNM was 20.81±0.03 mg/100 g, but fermentation of BNM did not produce any significant increase on the zinc 20.88±0.87mg/100g. Raw BNM had phytate content of 0.87±0.06 mg/100 g. After the solidstate fermentation of BNM, phytic acid was not detectable from the meal (Table 2). The analysis of tannins in BNM showed that raw BNM had 16.73± 0.06 mg/100 g of tannin. However, after solid state fermentation the tannins were no detectable (Table 3).

Trypsin inhibitors contained in the raw BNM was  $6.56\pm0.02$  mg/100 g. Similarly, the content of trypsin inhibitors in the raw BNM was  $6.56\pm0.02$  mg/100 g, while it was significantly reduced (P<0.05) to merely  $1.29\pm0.04$  mg/100g in.

The energy value of the BNM showed a significant increase from 12627.34±58.36 kcal of raw BNM to 13631.01±59.11 kcal (Table 3) of FBNM. Fermentation significantly increased the

protein content of AYB from  $23.65\pm0.07\%$  of raw AYB to  $34.56\pm1.36\%$  of fermented variant (Table 4). Lipid content of AYB were also increased from  $2.96\pm0.45\%$  (raw AYB) to  $5.76\pm0.09\%$  (fermented AYB). The carbohydrate content of the AYB was reduced by fermentation to to  $4.21\pm0.07\%$  (Table 4). The mineral content of

AYB increased after solid state fermentation compared to the raw AYB (Table 4). Conversely ANF like trypsin inhibitors, phytic acids and oxalic acid were drastically reduced or non-detectable (Table 4). The energy content of the meals also increased from 12550.55±0.26 Kcal of raw AYB to 14550.55±0.26kcal in the fermented variant.

Table 1. The proximate composition of raw bambara nut meal and African yam beans used in			
solid state fermentation			

Parameters	Bambaranut	African yam beans	FLSD <sub>0.05</sub>
Protein	24.82±0.15 <sup>a</sup>	18.61±0.39 <sup>c</sup>	0.1747
Lipid	7.11±0.01 <sup>b</sup>	5.19±0.03 <sup>°</sup>	0.18808
Carbohydrate	54.59±0.06 <sup>a</sup>	56.49±0.49 <sup>a</sup>	0.14325
Crude fiber	7.62±0.15 <sup>a</sup>	7.61±0.02 <sup>a</sup>	0.18487
Moisture	9.15±0.06 <sup>b</sup>	9.83±0.05 <sup>ª</sup>	0.21777
Dry matter	90.8±0.01 <sup>ns</sup>	90.17±0.05 <sup>ns</sup>	0.89255
Ash	4.52±0.03 <sup>c</sup>	4.93±0.04 <sup>b</sup>	0.14897
Phytic acid	0.87±0.06 <sup>c</sup>	1.02±0.09 <sup>b</sup>	0.15712
Energy	12627.34±58.36 <sup>a</sup>	12543.66±31.91 <sup>°</sup>	0.09812
Duration of a surger string of the surger string of			

Proximate compositions were measured in percentage (%) but energy was measured in kcal. Means not followed by same superscript are significantly different P<0.05, values are means ±SD

# Table 2. Proximate composition of solid state fermented bambaranut meal and African yam beans

Parameters	Bambaranut	African yam beans	FLSD 0.05
Protein	40.37±0.27 <sup>a</sup>	29.85±0.51 <sup>°</sup>	0.11480
Lipid	14.29±0.05 <sup>b</sup>	9.00±0.33 <sup>c</sup>	0.23079
Carbohydrate	20.65±0.27 <sup>b</sup>	29.86±1.03 <sup>a</sup>	0.12735
Crude fiber	2.41±0.06 <sup>b</sup>	2.00±0.01 <sup>°</sup>	0.14420
Moisture	16.26±0.59 <sup>b</sup>	18.83±0.90 <sup>ª</sup>	0.18095
Dry matter	83.74±0.58 <sup>ª</sup>	81.17±0.90 <sup>b</sup>	0.15113
Ash	4.53±0.03 <sup>a</sup>	3.13±0.08 <sup>c</sup>	0.23358
Phytic acid	nd	nd	
Energy	13631.01±59.11 <sup>b</sup>	13547.66±32.85 <sup>c</sup>	0.05812

Proximate compositions were measured in percentage (%) but energy was measured in kcal. Means not followed by same superscript are significantly different P<0.05, values are means  $\pm$ SD

Parameters in	Raw bambaranut	Fermented bambaranut
Trypsin inhibitor	6.56±0.02 <sup>a</sup>	3.29±0.04 <sup>b</sup>
Tannins	16.73± 0.06	nd
Calcium	8+.5 ±0.06 <sup>a</sup>	14.06±0.12 <sup>b</sup>
Phosphorous	74.56±0.78 <sup>b</sup>	140.56±0.56 <sup>a</sup>
Potasium	182.09±0.08 <sup>b</sup>	203.67±0.05 <sup>a</sup>
Copper	3.89±0.78 <sup>b</sup>	6.23±0.89 <sup>a</sup>
Sodium	19.98±0.56 <sup>b</sup>	29.09±0.08 <sup>a</sup>
Iron	1.57±0.07 <sup>ns</sup>	1.54±1.23 <sup>ns</sup>
Zinc	20.81±0.03 <sup>ns</sup>	20.88±0.87 <sup>ns</sup>
Energy	12627.34±58.36 <sup>b</sup>	13631.01±59.11 <sup>a</sup>

Means not followed by same superscript are significantly different P<0.05, Values are mean ±SD

Parameters	Raw African yam beans	Solid state fermented African yam beans
Oxalic acid	2.40 ±0.01	nd
Trypsin inhibitor	5.98 ±0.07	nd
Calcium	228.78±0.67 <sup>ns</sup>	231.6±0.07 <sup>ns</sup>
Phosphorous	24.06±0.09 <sup>b</sup>	57.94±0.04 <sup>a</sup>
Potassium	24.98±1.08 <sup>b</sup>	30.34±1.23 <sup>a</sup>
Magnesium	40.40 ±0.43 <sup>b</sup>	54.45±0.34 <sup>a</sup>
Copper	2.32±1.24ns	2.65±0.07ns
Sodium	348.39±0.07 <sup>b</sup>	398.56±0.08 <sup>ª</sup>
Iron	11.32±0.9ns	11.33±0.56ns
Zinc	7.09±0.21ns	6.04±1.02ns
Energy	12550.55±0.26 <sup>b</sup>	14550.55±0.26 <sup>a</sup>

Table 4. Minerals and anti-nutritional factors of raw and fermented African yam bean

Means not followed by same superscript are significantly different P<0.05, Values are means ±SD

#### 4. DISCUSSION

Solid state fermentation of BNM and AYB was useful in upgrading their nutritive values. Solid state fermentation process had been used for improvement of plant protein ingredients [2,9,23]. The increase in protein content of the fermented BNM from initial value of 24.82±0.15% [34.35], to 40.37± 0.27%, is significant guality improvement. The protein increase could be because microbe used in the solid-state fermentation secreted proteins as the fermentation proceeded. This had been noted in a previous work [36]. Solid state fermentation had been noted to increase the protein contents of fermented meals like bambaranut meal [23]; rapeseed cake [10]; Soybean meal [10] and cassava meal [37]. Reduction in carbohydrate content of BNM could also be due to hydrolysis of sugars and amylolytic activities of the L. acidophilus. Microbial amylase activities within fish gut has been documented [38]. The reduction in sugar contents makes BNM more suitable as feed ingredients for carnivorous fish. Bambaranut meal is known to have about 50-58% carbohydrate [39,35]. High content of carbohydrates could lead to hyperglycaemia in carnivorous fish [40], high glycogen and elevated hepatosomatic index [41,42,43]. The reduction in sugar could also mean that BNM inclusion in the diets of any fish could lead to lesser deposit of fat in the fish. Carbohydrates gets converted and stored as fat in the body of fish. The lipid content of the BNM was doubled after fermentation. This suggests more energy value of the feed if fermented BNM is used in production. Fish use lipids for their energy needs, thereby sparing protein [44]. The lipid content of BNM in the research, 7.11±0.01 and 14.29±0.05 for raw and fermented respectively was in line with previous findings of between 3.11±0.01% to 9.0% [45].

The increase in lipid content of fermented BNM would be beneficial in feed formulation because the energy value of the feed would be increased. Fermentation of BNM reduced the crude fiber content from 7.62±0.15 to 2.41±0.06%. This is important attribute since most fish find it hard to digest fiber. In a previous research [46] noted that fermentation of bambaranut was more effective in reducing ANF than other processing methods. The complete removal of phytic acid is very significant since phytic acid is a major ANF present in plant protein meal [47,48]. The increase in the protein content of fermented AYB is very significant and in line with previous findings of Chikwendu et al. [49] and Iyang and Zakari [50] on fermented AYB. Similar results were derived for fermented soybeans by Omafuvbe et al. [51], for rapeseed by Shi et al. [10] and for bambaranut meal Envidi and Etim [23]. The increase in protein content could be due to the increase in biomass of the bacteria agent of fermentation [2], and due to the proteolytic action of the bacteria. African yam beans have high content of lysine and an increase in the protein content may also lead to increase in some essential amino acids. In a previous research Wang et al. [52], and Uckun et al. [53], noted that solid state fermentation of rapeseed meal with Aspergillus oryzae produced free amino acids, increasing protein value of fermented meal. There is little lipid contained in AYB but solid sate fermentation increased AYB lipids content. This could be because of the possible utilization of the AYB carbohydrate and production of fatty acids and as energy source [10].

#### **5. CONCLUSIONS**

Solid state fermentation is a good means of upgrading the nutritional values of plant protein

meals. The reduction in carbohydrate content of the meals and the increase in energy level suggest that solid state fermented BNM and AYB could be good ingredients in diets of carnivorous fish. The upgrading of pant proteins using solid state fermentation could be easily applied in ingredient processing instead of dosing with micronutrients. Fermented plant proteins seem to be plausible choice ingredients in aquafeed manufacturing.

# **COMPETING INTERESTS**

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

# REFERENCES

- 1. Singhania RR, Patel AK, Soccol CR, Pandey A. Recent advances in solid-state fermentation. Biochemical Engineering Journal. 2009:44:13-18.
- 2. Lio JY, Wang T. Solid-state fermentation of sovbean and corn processing co-products for potential feed improvement. J. Agric. Food Chem. 2012;60:7702-7709.
- 3. Saw HY, Phang HK, Janaun J. Bulk properties of palm kernel cake for solidstate fermentation. Asian- Pacific Journal of Chemical Engineering. 2012;7:814-821.
- Papagianni M, Nokes SE, Filer K. 4. Submerged and solid-state phytase fermentation by Aspergillus niger: Effects of agitation and medium viscosity on phytase production, fungal morphology and inoculum performance. Food Technol. Biotechnol. 2001;39(4):319-326.
- Oojikaas LP, Weber FJ, Buitelaar RM, 5. Tramper J, Rinzema A. Defined media and inert supports: Their potential as solid-state fermentation production systems. Trends Biotechnol. 2000;18:356.
- 6. Robinson T, Singh D, Nigam P. Solid-state fermentation: A promising microbial technology for secondary metabolite production. Applied Microbiology and Biotechnology. 2001;55:284-289.
- 7. Machado CM, Oishi BO, Pandey A, Soccol CR. Kinetics of Gibberella fujikori growth and gibberellic acid production by solid state fermentation in a packed-bed column bioreactor. Biotechnology Progress. 2004:20:1449-1453.
- 8. Bhargav S, Panda BP, Ali M, Javed S. Solid-state fermentation: An overview. Chem Biochem Eng. Q. 2008;22(11):40-73.

9. Opazo R, Ortu' zar F, Navarrete P, Espejo R, Romero J. Reduction of soybean meal polysaccharides non-starch and agalactosides by solid-state fermentation using cellulolytic bacteria obtained from different environments. PLoS ONE. 2012;7(9):e44783. DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0044783

Shi C, He J, Yu J, Yu B, Huang Z, Mao X,

- 10. Zheng P, Chen D. Solid state fermentation of rapeseed cake with Aspergillus niger for degrading glucosinolates and upgrading nutritional value. Journal of Animal Science and Biotechnology. 2015;6(13):2-7.
- Dai XJ, Liu MQ, Jin HX, Jing MY. 11. Optimisation of solid-state fermentation of Aspergillus niger JL-15 for xylanase production xylooligosaccharides and preparation. Czech J. Food Sci 2011;29:557-567.
- Magalhães R, Díaz-Rosales P, Diógenes 12. AF, Enes P, Oliva-Teles A, Peres H. Improved digestibility of plant ingredientbased diets for European seabass (Dicentrarchus labrax) with exogenous enzyme supplementation. Aquacult Nutr. 2018:1-9.
- Evans IM, Boulter D. Amino acid 13. composition of seeds of meals of yam bean (Sphenostylis sternocarpa) and Lima bean (Phaseolus innatus). J. Sci Food Agric. 1974;25:919-922.
- Uguru MI, Madukaife SO. Studies on the 14. variability in agronomic and nutritive characteristics of African yam bean (Sphenostylis stenocarpa Hochst ex. A. Rich. Harms). Plant Production and Research Journal. 2001;6:10-19.
- Oke MO, Sobowale SS, Ogunlakin O. 15. Evaluation of the effects processing methods on the anti nutritional compositions of two underutilized Nigerian grain legumes. Pakistan Journal of Biological Sciences. 2013;16(24):2015-2020.
- Obizoba IC, Egbunam HI. Effect of 16. germination and fermentation on the nutritional quality of Bambaranut (Voandzeia subterranea L. Thouars) and its product (milk). Plant Food for Human Nutrition. 1992;42:13-23.
- Basu S. Roberts JA. Azam-Ali SN. Maves 17. S. Bambara groundnut. In: Pulse, sugar and tuber crops. Genome mapping and molecular breeding in plants, (Kole, C. Ed.), Springer- Verlag Berlin. 2007;3:147-157.

- Goli AE. Bibliographical review. In Heller, J., Begemann, F., Mushonga, J. (Eds). Proceedings of the Workshop on Conservation and Improvement of Bambara Groundnut (*Vigna subterranea* (L.) Verdc.), Harare: Department of Research and Specialist Services. 1995;4.
- 19. Enyidi UD. Production of feeds for African catfish *Clarias gariepinus* using plant proteins. Jyvaskyla Studies in Biological Sciences. 2012;251. ISBN:978-951-39-4925-9, ISSN: 1456-9701.
- Dakora FD, Muofhe LM. Nitrogen fixation 20. and nitrogen nutrition in symbiotic Bambara groundnut (Vigna subterranean (L.) Verdc.) and Kersting's bean (Macrotyloma geocarpum (Harms) Marech. et Baud.) In: Hekler J., Begemann, F & Mushonga, J. (Eds.), Proceedings of the workshop conservation on and improvement of bambara groundnut (Vigna subterranea (L.) Verdc.), Harare Zimbabwe IPGRI Gatersleben/Department of Specialist Research & Services. Harare/International Plant Genetic Resources Institute, Rome, Italy. 1995;72-78.
- 21. Envidi UD, Pirhonen J, Kettunen J, Vilema J. Effect of feed protein: Lipid ratio on growth parameters of African Catfish Clarias gariepinus after fish meal substitution in the diet with bambaranut subterranea) (Voandzeia meal and soybean (Glycine max) meal. Fishes. 2017;2:1.

DOI: 10.3390/fishes2010001

- 22. Enyidi Uchechukwu, Juhani Pirhonen, Jouni Vielma. Effects of substituting soybean (*Glycine max*) meal with bambaranut (*Voandzeia subterranea*) meal on growth performance and survival of African catfish (*Clarias gariepinus*). International Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Studies. 2014;1(3):152-157.
- Enyidi UD, Etim EO. Use of solid state fermented bambaranut meal as substitute of fishmeal in the diets of African catfish *Clarias gariepinus*. Iranian Journal of Fisheries Sciences; 2018. DOI: 10.22092/ijfs.2018.119856
- 24. RingØ E, Gatesoupe FJ. Lactic acid bacteria in fish: A review. Aquaculture. 1998;160:177-203.
- 25. Aly SM, Ahmed YAG, Mohamed MF. Studies on *Bacillus subtilis* and *Lactobacillus acidophilus*, as potential probiotics, on the immune response and

resistance of Tilapia nilotica (*Oreochromis niloticus*) to challenge infection. Fish Shellfish Immunol. 2008;25:128-136.

- 26. Juodeikiene G, Bartkiene E, Viskelis P, Urbonaviciene D, Eidukonyte D, Bobinas C. Fermentation processes using lactic acid bacteria producing bacteriocins for preservation and improving functional properties of food products, in biochemistry, genetics and molecular biology. Advances in Applied Biotechnology, Ed. by Petre M. InTech, Rijeka, 2012:63-100.
- 27. Willey JM, Sherwood LM, Woolverton CJ. Prescott, Harley and Leins Microbiology 7<sup>th</sup> Edition. McGraw Hill New York, NY 10020. 2008;10.
- Hensyl WR. Bergey's manual of determinative bacteriology, 9<sup>th</sup> Ed., Williams & Wilkins, Baltimore, MD. Philadeiphia, Hong Kong, London, Munich, Sydney, Tokyo. 1994;155-156,179-209.
- 29. Cheesborough M. Medical laboratory manual for tropical countries II: Microbiology. Cambridge University Press. 2006;345.
- Weil AA, Harris JB. Vibrio cholerae. In Molecular Medical Microbiology Second Edition; 2015.
- Parrish CC. Determination of total lipid classes and fatty acids in aquatic samples. In: Wetzel RG, Art MT, Wainmann BC (Ed) Lipids in Freshwater Ecosystems. Springer-Verlag, New York, NY, USA. 1999;4-20.
- 32. Kainz M, Arts M, Mazumder A. Essential fatty acids in the planktonic food web and their ecological role for higher trophic level. Limnol Oceanogr. 2004;49:1784-1793.
- Wheeler EL, Ferrel RE. A method for phytic acid determination in wheat and wheat fractions. Cereal Chem. 1979;48:312–320.
- Nwokolo E. A natural assessment of African yam bean (*Spenostylis*) (Horstex A., Rich) Harm, and bambara *Voandzeia subterranea* L. J Science Food Agriculture. 1987;41(21):123-129.
- 35. Enyidi UD, Kiljunen M, Jones R, Vielma J, Pirhonen J. Nutrient assimilation by firstfeeding African catfish (*Clarias gariepinus*) assessed using stable isotope analysis. Journal of the World Aquaculture Society. 2013;44:161-172.
- 36. Elinbaum S, Ferreyra H, Ellenrieder G, Cuevas C. Production of *Aspergillus terreus* alpha-l-rhamnosidase by solid state

fermentation. Lett Appl Microbiol. 2002;34:67–71.

- Kaewwongsa W, Traiyakun S, Yuangklang C, Wachirapakorn C, Paegkoum P. Protein enrichment of cassava pulp fermentation by *Saccharomyces cerevisiae*. Journal of Animal and Veterinary Advances. 2011;10(18):2434-2440.
- Ray AK, Ghosh K, Ring E. Enzyme producing bacteria isolated from fish gut: A review. Aquaculture Nutrition. 2012;18:465-492.
- Sirivongpaisal P. Structure and functional properties of starch and flour from bambara groundnut. Songklanakarin Journal of Science and Technology. 2008;30:51–56.
- 40. Hemre GI, Mommsen TP, Krogdahl A. Carbohydrate in fish nutrition: Effects on growth metabolism and hepatic enzymes. Aquacult. Nutr. 2002;8:175-194.
- 41. Vielma J, Koskela J, Ruohonen K, Jokinen I, Kettunen J. Optimal diet composition for European whitefish (*Coregonus lavaretus*): Carbohydrate stress and immune parameter responses. Aquaculture. 2003;225:3-116.
- 42. Lee SM, Lee JH. Effects of dietary glucose, dextrin and starch on growth and body composition of juvenile starry flounder *Platichthys stellatus*. Fisheries Science. 2004;70:53-58.
- Moreira IS, Peres H, Couto A, Enes P, Oliva –Teles A. Temperature and dietary carbohydrate level effects on performance and metabolic utilization of diets in European sea bass (*Dicentrachus labrax*) juveniles. Aquaculture. 2008;27:153-160.
- 44. Luo Y, Xie X. Effects of high carbohydrate and high lipids diets on growth, body composition and glucose metabolism in southern catfish at two temperatures. Aquaculture Research. 2010;41:e431e437.
- 45. Minka SR, Bruneteau M. Partial chemical composition of bambara pea (Vigna

*subterranean* (L) Verde). Food Chem. 2000;68:273–276.

- Barimalaa IS, Anoghalu S. Effect of processing on certain anti nutrients in bambara groundnut (*Vigna subterranean*) cotyledons. J. Sci Food Agric. 1997;73:186-188.
- 47. Francis G, Makkar HPS, Becker K. Anti nutritional factors present in plant-derived alternate fish feed ingredients and their effects in fish. Aquaculture. 2001;199:197-227.
- 48. Krogdahl A, Penn M, Thorsen J, Bakke AM. Important antinutrients in plant feedstuffs for aquaculture: An update on recent findings regarding responses in salmonids. Aquaculture Research. 2010;41:333-344.
- 49. Chikwendu JN, Obiakor OP, Maduforo AN. Effects of fermentation on the nutrient and antinutrients composition of African yam bean (*Spenostylis stenocarpa*) seed and pearl millet (*Pennisetum glaucum*) grain. International Journal of Science and Technology. 2014;2:169-173.
- 50. Inyang CU, Zakari UM. Effect of germination and fermentation of pearl millet on proximate, chemical and sensory properties of instant Fura–Nigerian cereal food. Pakistan J. Nutr. 2009;7:9-12.
- Omafuvbe BO, Shonukan OO, Abiose SH. Microbiological and biochemical changes in the fermentation of soybean for soydaddawa – Nigeria food condiments. Food Microbiology. 2000;17:469-474.
- 52. Wang R, Shaarani SM, Godoy LC, Melikoglu M, Vergara CS, Koutinas A. Bioconversion of rapeseed meal for the production of a generic microbial feedstock. Enzyme Microb Technol. 2010;47:77–83.
- 53. Uckun KE, Salakkam A, Trzcinski AP, Bakir U, Webb C. Enhancing the value of nitrogen from rapeseed meal for microbial oil production. Enzyme Microb Technol. 2012;50:337–42.

© 2018 Enyidi and Ekeh; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

> Peer-review history: The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here: http://www.sdiarticle3.com/review-history/47647